

Facilitator's Guide for Module 3: Eliciting, Interpreting, and Using Evidence of Learning



The contents of this document were developed under a Race to the Top grant from the U.S. Department of Education. However, those contents do not necessarily represent the policy of the U.S. Department of Education, and you should not assume endorsement by the Federal Government.

Table of Contents

Preparations for the CoP Meeting.....	1
Where the CoP Has Been and Where It Is Going.....	1
Key Concepts in Module 3	2
Using Formative Assessment Routines.....	3
Using Evidence to Inform Instruction	4
Agenda for Module 3 Community of Practice	6
Participant Agenda for Module 3 CoP Meeting	7
Facilitator’s Agenda for CoP Meeting for Module 3	9
Appendix A: My Initial Reflections on Module 3.....	14
Appendix B: Frequently Asked Questions/Misconceptions with Suggested Responses	15
Appendix C: Handouts and Evaluation Form	17
Appendix D: Extended Learning Opportunities.....	29
References	31
Online Resources.....	32

Facilitator’s Guide for Module 3: Eliciting, Interpreting, and Using Evidence of Learning

The facilitator’s guide for Module 3 contains the following:

- A review of the key concepts in Module 3;
- A participant’s agenda and an annotated facilitator’s agenda for the third 90-minute meeting of your Community of Practice (CoP);
- Appendices (frequently asked questions or misconceptions with suggested responses, materials for the CoP meeting, a list of extended learning opportunities, and references).

Preparations for the CoP Meeting

In preparation for facilitating the third meeting with your Community of Practice, you will want to review the Module 3 online course and this facilitator guide, including the appendices. If you have not already done so, you will also want to read the two readings associated with this module:

- Five “Key Strategies” for Effective Formative Assessment by Dylan Wiliam; and
- *Using Rubrics to Promote Thinking and Learning* by Heidi Goodrich Andrade.

Prior to the CoP meeting, you might want to have informal conversations with each participant to get a sense of their understanding of the key concepts in Module 3 and to check on their progress on the application activity—choosing an upcoming lesson, selecting a routine they are going to use to solicit formative evidence in that lesson, determining how they will collect that evidence (one strategy might be to use the Formative Assessment Lesson Planning Template on pages 19-20 in Appendix C as a graphic organizer), collecting the evidence, and bringing the data they gathered to the CoP for analysis with a partner. If CoP members have not yet started to incorporate a formative assessment routine into an upcoming lesson, ask them to bring an upcoming lesson and to select one of the five formative assessment routines that they think could easily be incorporated into the lesson. You might also remind them to bring their completed CoP prep form to the meeting (see Appendix A).

Where the CoP Has Been and Where It Is Going

At this point, participants should have a solid base of understanding of what big ideas, learning goals, success criteria, and learning progressions are. Module 3 and the work in the CoP builds on this by focusing on the use of formative assessment routines to elicit evidence of learning, analyzing that evidence, and using the information to change their instruction to meet students’ needs. In this module,

teachers move from understanding abstract ideas to concrete use of formative assessment routines. As they explore the use of a particular routine in their classroom, they will see the importance of planning—for asking targeted questions to gather evidence of what their students know and what they still need to acquire to meet specific learning goals and success criteria. They begin to see that formative assessment can, and does, have an effect on student interest in learning and on helping to establish an assessment culture in their classroom.

Note: At this point, teachers will need to understand the major concepts presented in Module 2, including big ideas, learning goals, success criteria, and learning progressions. Teachers may not yet be clear about how to apply these ideas in their own classrooms, but should feel knowledgeable about the underlying concepts. If the teachers in your CoP are lacking that conceptual understanding from Module 2, they would benefit from the extended learning activities in the Module 2 CoP Facilitator’s Guide.

Key Concepts in Module 3

Learning Goals for the CoP Meeting on Module 3:

- Increase knowledge and use of formative assessment routines in my classroom
- Explore the use of formative data to adjust instruction
- Better understand how to structure lesson planning so that eliciting and using evidence becomes a part of my planning process

Success Criteria for the CoP Meeting on Module 3:

- I can use a variety of routines for eliciting and using evidence linked to learning goals and success criteria in my classroom.
- I can use evidence to inform and adjust instruction to meet students’ needs.
- I can list three or four ways that including formative assessment elements in my lesson planning process will contribute to more effective eliciting, interpreting, and using data during instruction.

In the last two modules, teachers have learned that formative assessment is a continuous process that is integrated into instruction and designed to collect evidence of how student learning is progressing toward specific learning goals and success criteria. The learning progression associated with a specific learning goal enables teachers, and ultimately students, to identify what they know and what they need to learn to reach the learning goal and demonstrate their knowledge in terms of the success criteria. Module 3 focuses on planning, eliciting, interpreting, and using evidence to adjust instruction. Its content explores several key concepts more deeply:

- There are five key formative assessment routines through which teachers can elicit evidence of student thinking and learning: pre-assessment, classroom discussion and academic dialogue, questioning, analysis of a student’s written work, and observation.

- With all formative practice, the routines for eliciting evidence begin with clarity about what students are being asked to learn (the learning goal) and what they can do to demonstrate that they have learned it (success criteria).
- Teachers adjust their instruction based on interpretation of the evidence, their understanding of their learners, and their knowledge of academic content.

Using Formative Assessment Routines

Depending on their experience, knowledge, and skill, teachers will be at various places on a continuum related to the ease with which they implement formative assessment routines aligned with instruction. It is important for them to understand that their existing instructional routines ground their work in formative assessment and can guide or at least provide an entry point for collecting evidence of learning. Eliciting evidence is not so much about “how” teachers do it, but about knowing *what* to collect and what to do with that information once they have it. Teachers need to consider options that will work within their classroom routines, for example:

- A range of assessment tasks (see the next page) can help teachers observe students as they explore and apply new information, and help determine exactly where a student is on a learning progression.
- The simplest way is to create a table, which lists students in the class in the left-hand column and the success criteria across the top. Teachers can use the data they collect to populate the table to see trends as well as whole group, small group, and individual needs related to next steps in learning (see example of a pre-assessment scoring tally for the middle school digestive system unit on page 21 in Appendix C).

Evidence that is gathered and not used wastes instructional time, so eliciting evidence should be based on what the teacher needs to know and from whom they need to obtain it. Evidence can be collected on a whole class, a group of students, or specific students.

Note: Evidence collection does not need to include all students. If a teacher knows where a student is on a learning progression, she doesn't need to assess the student. This is a hard concept for teachers to grasp, because the assessment models that teachers have been taught to use in the past most often assess everyone at the same time, every time.

Eliciting and using evidence go hand in hand in the formative assessment process. Rather than collecting the data first and then thinking about how to use it, the teacher in a formative classroom thinks first about how he or she will use the evidence. Once that is solidified, how to gather the data becomes clearer.

*Note: While it sometimes helps to know what students get wrong, it is **OFTEN MORE IMPORTANT** to see and make sense of what students get right. If teachers understand what a student **CAN** do, it is much easier to identify where the student can go next.*

For teachers who are embarking on formative assessment without previous experience to build upon, the five formative assessment routines introduced in Module 3 can provide a starting point (see pages 22-25 in Appendix C for a fuller description of each routine). Each provides information that informs teachers' grouping of students, concepts to be re-introduced or reinforced, or skills that have been mastered.

- **Pre-assessment** allows teachers to uncover students' knowledge prior to beginning instruction. It identifies students who have already mastered some of the skills in the lesson or unit, those who have foundational knowledge that will quickly lead to their grasping key concepts, and those who have misconceptions or are lacking prerequisite skills.
- **Classroom discussions and academic dialogue** permit teachers to better understand what students know, the strategies they are using, and how they are thinking about content. The classroom climate for rich, equitable, academic dialogue requires that students feel safe to explain their answers, share their solutions or strategies with the group, or articulate partially formed ideas. Mistakes and misconceptions are valuable and important to uncover and explore.
- **Questioning** is one of the most powerful tools teachers have to elicit and explore student thinking. A teacher's series of well-planned questions can quickly illuminate what students are thinking. Questioning to support formative assessment should involve a significant percentage of higher-order questions as they engage students in more cognitively complex thinking, e.g., formulating a summary of ideas, making inferences, creating new scenarios, or forming judgments based on evidence.
- **Analyzing Student's Written Work** offers rich information about what students know and about how they know it. It is not necessarily a formal, pen-and-paper task. For many students and learning goals this is not the most efficient or accurate way to establish what students know and how they are approaching their learning. When planning to gather written evidence, teachers can consider alternate forms of written assessment including drawing, concept maps, model building, representations, graphic organizers, and detailed outlines.
- **Observation** permits teachers to meet the challenge of collecting a range of evidence from a variety of sources to document student growth and learning over time. Several routines support observation and documentation over time, e.g., whole class logs, portfolios, dialogue journals, and conferences.

One of the most difficult aspects of evidence collection is tracking information over time. Teachers do need to document this work, but not in the same way, to the same degree, or for the same purposes as "high stakes" documentation. Over time, eliciting and documenting learning in a formative classroom engages students more fully so that they become the primary authors, evidence collectors, and communicators about their progress.

Using Evidence to Inform Instruction

After analyzing the evidence they have gathered on students' knowledge of content and their thinking, teachers adjust their instruction on a day-to-day basis to help their students "close the gap" between

their current knowledge and understanding and the desired learning goal. They select learning experiences that will appropriately challenge students. This may mean re-grouping students; re-teaching content in another way for an entire class, a small group, or an individual; changing instructional materials or resources; or adjusting the pacing or sequencing of lesson content.

Formative assessment evidence should align and inform existing models of student support, including Response to Intervention, re-teach blocks, and other specialist services. If your school has models in place that support multiple educators in the classroom at the same time (e.g., special education inclusion models or push-in English Language programs), formative evidence provides rich and current evidence of learning needs that can and should inform their work. In these scenarios, teachers report that the support to move learning forward based on classroom formative assessment is very helpful.

Agenda for Module 3 Community of Practice

As the facilitator, your role is to provide opportunities for participants to reflect on their learning from the online course, deepen their understanding by discussing their learning, and determine how to embed formative assessment in their instructional practice.

The learning goals and success criteria for the third 90-minute meeting of your CoP are offered below. A participant agenda and an annotated facilitator's agenda follow.

Learning Goals for the CoP Meeting on Module 3:

- Increase knowledge and use of formative assessment routines in my classroom
- Explore the use of formative data to adjust instruction
- Better understand how to structure lesson planning so that eliciting and using evidence becomes a part of my planning process

Success Criteria for the CoP Meeting on Module 3:

- I can use a variety of routines for eliciting and using evidence linked to learning goals and success criteria in my classroom.
- I can use evidence to inform and adjust instruction to meet students' needs.
- I can list three or four ways that including formative assessment elements in my lesson planning process will contribute to more effective eliciting, interpreting, and using data during instruction.

Participant Agenda for Module 3 CoP Meeting

Learning Goals:

- Increase knowledge and use of formative assessment routines in my classroom
- Explore the use of formative data to adjust instruction
- Better understand how to structure lesson planning so that eliciting and using evidence becomes a part of my planning process

Success Criteria:

- I can use a variety of routines for eliciting and using evidence linked to learning goals and success criteria in my classroom.
- I can use evidence to inform and adjust instruction to meet students' needs.
- I can list three or four ways that including formative assessment elements in my lesson planning process will contribute to more effective eliciting, interpreting, and using data during instruction.

Upon arrival	<p>Explore Our Learning from the Online Course</p> <p><i>Purpose:</i> Identify what I understand from Module 3 and what I would like to discuss with my colleagues to develop a common understanding on how to elicit, interpret, and use evidence.</p> <p><i>Outcome:</i> Identification of which topics need more exploration and dialogue for the CoP to have a clear understanding of the content in Module 3.</p>
5 minutes	<p>Getting Started</p> <p><i>Purpose:</i> Review today's agenda, learning goals, and success criteria.</p> <p><i>Outcome:</i> Clarity regarding the learning goals and success criteria for today's meeting.</p>
15 minutes	<p>Reflecting Experience</p> <p><i>Purpose:</i> Explore ways in which formative assessment routines fit into my daily instruction.</p> <p><i>Outcomes:</i> Identify a variety of ways to include or extend formative assessment routines into instruction.</p>
30 minutes	<p>Deepen Understanding of Key Content in Relation to Current Context</p> <p><i>Purpose:</i> Understand how the formative assessment lesson planning template allows</p>

	<p>me to deliberately integrate formative assessment and instruction; share planning with and gain feedback from a partner.</p> <p><i>Outcome:</i> Gain a deeper understanding of how to integrate formative assessment and instruction, collect and analyze evidence, and plan appropriate instructional adjustments.</p>
25 minutes	<p>Integrating Key Concepts with Our Current Practice</p> <p><i>Purpose:</i> Explore ways in which we are using formative assessment routines in our classrooms.</p> <p><i>Outcome:</i> Identify a variety of ways to include or extend formative assessment routines into instruction.</p>
5 minutes	<p>Notice What’s Changing, What’s New</p> <p><i>Purpose:</i> Reflect on my learning.</p> <p><i>Outcome:</i> Gain an understanding of what in my thinking and practice is changing.</p>
5 minutes	<p>Agree on Next Steps</p> <p><i>Purpose:</i> Identify what needs more discussion in the CoP group to reach a common understanding of the concepts in Module 3.</p> <p><i>Outcomes:</i> List of concepts that need more discussion in our CoP and agreed-upon next steps.</p>
5 minutes	<p>Evaluation</p> <p><i>Purpose:</i> Assess my background knowledge of eliciting, interpreting, and using evidence of learning to help me determine my next step in learning, and provide feedback to the CoP facilitator.</p> <p><i>Outcome:</i> Information for me and for our facilitator to use in planning the next meeting and providing assistance to individual CoP members.</p>

Facilitator’s Agenda for CoP Meeting for Module 3

Time Allotted	Purpose/Outcome	Facilitator’s Tasks	Set-up
Upon arrival	<p>Explore Our Learning from the Online Course Purpose: Identify what teachers understand from Module 3, what they are unclear about, and what topics they would like to discuss with their colleagues to develop a common understanding.</p> <p>Uncover misconceptions (see Appendix B for succinct responses to frequently asked questions and misconceptions).</p> <p>Outcome: Identification of which concepts in Module 3 need more exploration and discussion to come to a common understanding within the CoP.</p>	<p>Greet participants as they arrive and ask them to review the notes on their CoP prep form (see Appendix A), highlight one thing in each column that they would like to share, record each on a separate sticky, and post them in the appropriate column on the chart paper. (Other options: chart them or have participants share them orally.)</p> <p><i>[Note: This is an identification of what participants learned and what can be discussed further during this session. There is no discussion at this point.]</i></p>	<p>Post large sheet(s) of chart pack with three columns headed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What’s clear? • What’s unclear? • What would I like to spend time talking to colleagues about to develop a common understanding? <p>Place post-it stickies on the table.</p>
5 minutes	<p>Getting Started Purpose: Review the CoP’s agenda, learning goals, and success criteria.</p> <p>Outcome: Clarity regarding the learning goals and success criteria for today’s meeting.</p>	<p>Review agenda, learning goals, and success criteria for this meeting.</p>	<p>Post agenda, learning goals, and success criteria for this CoP meeting on chart paper.</p>
15 minutes	<p>Reflecting Experience Purpose: Explore ways in which we are using formative assessment routines in our classrooms.</p> <p>Outcomes: Identify a variety of ways to include or extend formative assessment routines into instruction.</p>	<p>Set up: In Module 3, the teachers were introduced to five formative assessment routines. In this activity, they are going to share how they have used these routines in their instruction or how they could envision using them in classrooms.</p> <p>Ask participants to count off by fours. One member of each group draws a routine from the hat or box, and moves with their group to one corner of the room. Each group should have at least 2-3 members. If the group is</p>	<p>Chart pack and markers.</p> <p>One hat or box containing five slips of paper, each with a different routine written on it.</p> <p>Post prompts:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brainstorm or discuss two examples of how you have used this formative assessment routine in your classroom since beginning the online course. OR • Discuss how you envision using this routine with ease in your instruction.

Time Allotted	Purpose/Outcome	Facilitator's Tasks	Set-up
		<p>smaller, do the activity with three routines.</p> <p>Ask the groups to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brainstorm or discuss two examples of how they have used this formative assessment routine in their classroom since beginning the online course. OR • Share how they envision using this routine with ease in their instruction. <p>Returning to the large group, have each group share at least one example with their colleagues.</p>	
30 minutes	<p>Deepen Understanding of Key Content in Relation to Current Context</p> <p>Purposes: Understand how the formative assessment lesson planning template allows the deliberate integration of formative assessment and instruction; share planning with and gain feedback from a partner.</p> <p>Outcome: Gain a deeper understanding of how to integrate formative assessment and instruction, collect and analyze evidence, and plan appropriate instructional adjustments.</p>	<p>Set up: The formative assessment lesson planning template is a tool or resource to use when teachers are first exploring how to integrate these routines into their instruction. It is a good graphic organizer for their thoughts and plans. After the process becomes second nature to them, it is not necessary to fill the template out for every lesson.</p> <p>Depending on how far participants got in their assignment for Module 3, select one of the following activities to do with your CoP. In each scenario, participants are working with a partner, who is their critical friend.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. If participants didn't complete their templates, ask them to think about an upcoming lesson, determine the formative assessment routine for collecting evidence that fits best with the lesson, and use the template on pages 19-20 in Appendix C as a graphic organizer to plan their lessons together. They might find the first columns 	<p>Each teacher will need to bring the work they have done on their formative assessment lesson planning template or an upcoming lesson.</p> <p>Post the appropriate prompts on chart paper for the pairs to answer as they share their work with each other.</p> <p>Enough copies of "Moving from Planning to Action: Eliciting, Interpreting, and Using Evidence of Learning to Adjust Teaching and Inform Feedback" on pages 26-27 in Appendix C for each participant.</p>

Time Allotted	Purpose/Outcome	Facilitator's Tasks	Set-up
		<p>in the matrix on pages 26-27 in Appendix C helpful.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. If participants have completed the template (up to sections on descriptive feedback and self- and peer assessment), ask them to: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Identify the routine they selected and why; b. Share the evidence they collected; c. Analyze the evidence together; d. Brainstorm an appropriate instructional adjustment. 3. If participants completed the template, collected and analyzed evidence, made adjustments in their instruction, and documented what they did, ask the pairs to discuss: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The routine they used; b. Their analysis of the evidence and the adjustment they made in their teaching; c. Their documentation on how the instructional modification worked; d. What was difficult in the process; e. What they learned. <p><i>[Note: You might want to set a timer during this activity to ensure that each participant has 12-13 minutes to present and get feedback on what they've accomplished from a partner. As you circulate among the groups, your role is to observe and listen for themes.]</i></p>	

Time Allotted	Purpose/Outcome	Facilitator's Tasks	Set-up
25 minutes	<p>Integrating Key Concepts with Our Current Practice Purpose: Reflect on their experiences in eliciting, interpreting, and using evidence in their own classroom.</p> <p>Outcome: Extend and increase use of routines through learning about the strengths of other CoP members.</p>	<p>This activity is a whole group debrief based on their previous discussion. Prompts for the discussion might be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How is this type of data collection different from how you've used evidence in the past? • Has anyone tried a new data collection strategy that they are willing to share? What worked? What would you do differently next time? • What types of "grouping" information surfaced? Were there any surprises? • What was an example of where you moved along faster in the lesson because of collecting evidence? • What challenges have you faced in implementing formative assessment routines in your classroom? How have you overcome them? • From what you've done with formative assessment in your classroom so far, what have you noticed about the student role? 	
5 minutes	<p>Notice What's Changing, What's New Purpose: Individually reflect on their learning.</p> <p>Outcome: Individual understanding of how CoP members' thinking and practice are changing and information for facilitator as to where each participant is and needs to move.</p>	<p>Ask participants to respond to a reflective prompt: "I used to say and now I say..."</p> <p>Facilitate sharing of reflections from two or three participants. Collect index cards, review responses after the session, and use in planning the next session.</p>	Post reflective question on chart paper and place index cards on tables.
5 minutes	<p>Agree on Next Steps Purpose: Identify what still needs more discussion from the initial activity and share appropriate extended learning opportunities with individuals or the CoP (see Appendix D).</p>	Facilitate the group's review of the status of their responses to the initial activity (e.g., what is clear, what needs more discussion to arrive at a common understanding). Ask participants to use their hand to signal their depth of understanding ("Fist to Five"). A fist means, "I	<p>A copy of Appendix B for each participant.</p> <p>Chart paper from initial activity, blank chart paper, and markers.</p>

Time Allotted	Purpose/Outcome	Facilitator's Tasks	Set-up
	<p>Outcome: List of aspects of Module 3 that need more discussion; identification of ways that individuals or groups can address these with extended learning opportunities in Appendix D.</p>	<p>don't understand any of it," while all five fingers out means, "I understand it completely." They can use 1, 2, 3, or 4 fingers to show various degrees of clarity. Place a star in front of ones that need more attention, and suggest appropriate extended learning opportunities.</p> <p><i>[Notes: You might want to note the evidence you are collecting, e.g., who are the "highs" – five fingers out – and who are the "lows". You can use that evidence to encourage the highs to talk to the lows before the next meeting.</i></p> <p><i>You may want to give a copy of Appendix B to all participants even if the questions aren't raised during the meeting.]</i></p>	
5 minutes	<p>Evaluation Purpose: Gather feedback that will help teachers to determine their next step in learning; obtain information that will assist you in planning the next session.</p> <p>Outcome: Information for me and for our facilitator to use in planning the next meeting and providing assistance to individual CoP members.</p>	<p>Ask participants to complete the evaluation form to obtain an understanding of their next step in learning and to help you plan for the next session.</p>	<p>Make a copy of the evaluation form on page 28 in Appendix C for each participant.</p>
90 minutes in total			

Appendix A: My Initial Reflections on Module 3
Engaging Students to Take Next Steps in Learning

Name: _____

What's clear	What's not clear
What would I like to spend time talking to colleagues about to develop a common understanding?	

Appendix B: Frequently Asked Questions/Misconceptions with Suggested Responses

Q: Isn't eliciting, analyzing, and using evidence primarily the role of the teacher?

A: Teachers must model how to elicit and use evidence of learning, but the ultimate work of formative assessment is to help students be the primary elicitors and users of evidence to continually move closer to attaining a specific learning goal. This requires a gradual transfer of responsibility from teacher to student, as students become familiar with learning goals and success criteria and develop their self- and peer assessment skills.

Q: We already collect a lot of evidence, why is formative data different?

A: The formative assessment process allows teachers to determine what evidence they and their students will gather to assess their learning and how both will use it to inform students' next steps in learning. The evidence is immediately available and acted upon, and it is specifically aligned to the learning goal and success criteria.

Q: Doesn't evidence have to be valid and reliable?

A: Although data has to be valid and reliable in summative assessment (high-stakes, statewide assessments), formative assessment is not used for high-stakes placement. It is an ongoing, dynamic process—a day-to-day gauge of progress for students and teachers. New data replaces old quickly and teachers are always integrating multiple sources of data into formative assessment.

Q: Won't we be swimming in data if we are collecting evidence all the time?

A: When data collection becomes so time-consuming and intensive that the evidence is not used to adjust instruction, teachers need to pause and re-think what they can do to collect data in a more streamlined, efficient, and useful way. Data collected and not used by teachers or students wastes precious instructional time.

How much data is too much is a nearly impossible question to answer, because that varies so much from classroom to classroom. Teachers in formative assessment classrooms know in a fairly specific way where each student is along the learning progression. If teachers know where most students are in relation to a given learning goal, they don't need to collect additional whole class data on that goal. If teachers don't know where three students are in relation to the goal, they need to check in and take some quick anecdotal notes for those students. If teachers do not have a good sense of where each student is on the learning goal, they probably need to collect more evidence. If they know where students are but think their students are not aware, it is time to use peer or self-assessment to help students understand where they are on the learning progression.

It is important to note that teachers do not and should not have to collect and document every piece of assessment evidence. Ultimately, students should be the ones primarily responsible for *tracking and*

documenting evidence of learning, both to show their progress along the way (practice, formative basis) and to show their attainment of the learning goal (final products, demonstrations, summative tasks).

Q: How can we streamline data collection?

A: Dylan Wiliam states that one of the most difficult aspects of a transition to formative assessment for teachers is giving up old instructional practices, while replacing them with new ones that will have a greater impact on students' learning. Often, in the transition, teachers "add" (sometimes a lot with good intentions) without "subtracting." For instance, they may add a variety of quick checks or self-assessment tasks but continue to give the quizzes and tests that have been part of a unit for years. In this scenario, the teacher has to grade the quizzes and tests in addition to reviewing student results on the formative tasks. Something has to be subtracted here; preferably, the tasks that have less impact on student learning.

In one school, teachers are implementing a slightly different formative model, based on work done through the National Science Foundation called "Assessment Centered Teaching." Rather than create lots of formative assessment tasks, this model has teachers think about and plan for "junctures" in learning. Junctures are key markers that the teachers want to be sure students meet, things they must know in order to progress on a particular topic. The teachers at this school have developed "juncture assessments" that capture what students know at critical points in the unit. With this in place, teachers do not feel compelled to gather evidence each day, but they are aware and agree on each of the building blocks (learning progressions) for each unit of study and pay special attention to measuring those at key "junctures." If teachers feel like they are collecting masses of evidence, thinking about key junctures might be a helpful way to streamline.

Appendix C: Handouts and Evaluation Form

Formative Assessment Lesson Planning Template
Part 1 – Clarifying and communicating the focus of the lesson

Academic content standard(s)	
Big Idea	
Learning goal(s) <i>Students will know and be able to:</i>	Success criteria <i>Students can:</i>
Student friendly learning goals <i>Students are able to:</i>	Student friendly success criteria <i>I can:</i>
Misconceptions students are likely to have as they work on the unit learning goals	
Strategies to share learning goals and success criteria with students	

Formative Assessment Lesson Planning Template Part 2 – Planning for formative assessment

How I will gather evidence of student learning - Classroom strategies to elicit evidence		
<i>Collecting Evidence Start of lesson</i>	<i>Collecting evidence Middle of lesson</i>	<i>Collecting evidence End of lesson</i>
Key discussion questions I will pose during instruction		
<i>Discussion questions Start of lesson</i>	<i>Discussion questions Middle of lesson</i>	<i>Discussion questions End of lesson</i>
When I will provide descriptive feedback to students		
Strategies for self- and peer assessment		
<i>Self and peer assessment Start of lesson</i>	<i>Self and peer assessment Middle of lesson</i>	<i>Self and peer assessment End of lesson</i>

Pre-Assessment Scoring Tally

Case Review Middle School Science

Student	Able to place organ (# out of 11)	Able to explain organ function (# out of 3)	Describes "system" of digestion	Notes
Audra	6	3	+	Lesser organs not known
Ben	9	3	+	Added salivary glands, bile duct, incorrectly placed small/large intestine
Carrissa	3	1	-	*Recommend pre-teach
Daniel	6	2	√	Incorrectly placed small/large intestine
Eliana	5	1	-	*Recommend pre-teach
Fiona	10	3	+	Added salivary glands, epiglottis
Gemma	10	3	+	No additions
Harris	4	1	-	Lesser organs not know *Recommend pre-teach
Jordan	8	3	√	Incorrectly placed small/large intestine
Kalinda	6	3	√	
Laila	5	1	-	*Recommend pre-teach
Madison	5	1	√	Verbal check-in/confer
Mackenzie	11	3	+	
Nolan	2	0	-	*Recommend pre-teach
Otto	9	3	+	
Paige	5	3	√	Trouble with diagram? Check-in before pre-teach
Regan	11	3	+	Added three organs
Sadie	8	3	+	Lesser organs not known
Ty	7	2	√	Small/large intestine incorrect placement
Wyatt	8	3	√	Small/large intestine incorrect placement
Xavier	5	3	√	Trouble with diagram? Verbal check-in
AVERAGES	7	2.2		

Five Instructional Routines for Eliciting Evidence of Student Thinking and Learning

Introduction

Formative assessment involves continuously collecting and using evidence to move student learning forward. Students and teachers work together to use that evidence as they strive to ensure that learning is continuously on track. Once clear about learning goals and success criteria, teachers must decide how they will gather the evidence they need. There is no single way to collect evidence. Rather than thinking about formative assessment as requiring lots of evidence collection strategies, there are five classroom routines through which teachers can elicit evidence of learning.

While each of these instructional routines supports formative assessment, there are conditions that must be met for them to be effective. First, student evidence that is collected must be aligned to learning goals. Second, in order for assessment to be formative, evidence must inform an action which results in improving learning. Third, though formative classrooms may appear to be fluid and spontaneous, there is extensive planning that must take place in order for teachers to select, gather, and review the most helpful evidence of learning.

Eliciting evidence through pre-assessment

As instruction begins on any unit, it is likely that some students will have already mastered some of the skills the teacher is about to introduce, and others may already have foundational knowledge that will quickly lead to their grasping key concepts. Some students will have misconceptions, or will be lacking prerequisite skills. Pre-assessment practices help teachers:

- Identify students' prior knowledge
- Understand student depth of knowledge
- Identify gaps in skills or content
- Elicit misconceptions
- Clarify where to begin in instruction

Pre-assessment routines support student learning by helping students to activate prior knowledge, explore connections across content areas, and engage in thinking about the learning goal. There are a wide variety of **knowledge activation techniques** that serve to elicit student understanding. Well-documented strategies include K-W-L charts, quick writes, checklists, carousel brainstorming, entrance tickets, and white board prompts. In formative assessment these types of knowledge activation techniques become routine practices, indistinguishable from instructional tasks.

Eliciting evidence through classroom discussions and academic dialogue

Classroom discussions provide students with time to clarify their understanding. When students are engaging in academic talk they are thinking, exploring ideas, and making connections. When students

talk, teachers can better understand what students know, the strategies they are using, and how they are thinking about the content. Creating a classroom culture in which there is equitable academic talk amongst all students does not happen without extensive teacher support. Teachers must clearly define the purposes and parameters of classroom dialogue, provide scaffolds for student learning, and establish times for student talk. With these structures firmly in place, teachers and students can use dialogue and discussion to continuously elicit and apply evidence of learning.

Effective classroom discussions require **significant guidance from teachers**. Students simply do not just engage in academic conversations on their own. Teachers must develop consistent routines for academic dialogue through scaffolds, prompts, and modeling. The classroom climate for rich academic dialogue requires that students feel safe to explain their answers, share their solutions or strategies with the group, or articulate partially formed ideas. Mistakes and misconceptions are valuable and important to uncover and explore.

In a culture that supports formative assessment practice, **all students are expected to be engaged**. When assessing through classroom discussion a typical routine is “no hands,” which means that students who don’t volunteer will be called upon to speak, or practices such as “popsicle stick” or “ball toss” may be used to ensure that each student participates in discussion.

Whole class discussions provide opportunities to **build collective knowledge and understanding** that is central to exploring and deepening student thinking. Having students report out different solutions to the same problem reinforces the idea that there are many different ways to learn and think, and that how students approach the problem is as important as which answer they may have gotten. Classroom dialogue routines are enhanced through the use of **small group dialogue** with well-designed instructional tasks or prompts. Teachers can observe small group discussion with a keen eye towards capturing evidence of student learning on a written observation template or by making mental notes about specific students’ progress.

Eliciting evidence through questioning

Questioning is one of the most powerful tools teachers have at hand to elicit and explore student thinking. A series of questions can quickly illuminate what and how students are thinking. A central idea in classroom formative assessment research is that learning always begins with what the student currently knows. In this way, teachers and students work together to uncover student thinking and use that information to explore next steps in learning. Effective use of classroom questioning provides ongoing checks that help to uncover student understandings **throughout the learning sequence**. Effective oral questioning aids cognitive growth, provides connections to prior knowledge, contributes to a classroom culture that promotes learning and risk-taking, and supports students’ ability to internalize next steps in learning.

Questioning to support formative assessment should involve a significant percentage of **higher-order thinking** questions, often referred to as “open” questions. Because they do not have a “right” answer, open questions engage students in more cognitively complex thinking, e.g., formulating a summary of

ideas, making inferences, creating new scenarios, forming judgments based on evidence. It also means employing key support strategies that give questioning techniques their power, e.g., allowing for sufficient wait time before calling on a student, after calling on a student, or after a student answers.

There are five essential elements of effective questioning in formative assessment: 1) planning a sequence of questions that can prompt student thinking throughout the lesson; 2) using questions to engage in assessment conversations, i.e., the teacher asks a question, the student responds, and then the teacher uses the student response to further learning and explore student thinking; 3) using wrong answers to uncover thinking and move learning forward; 4) applying the research on effective questioning, e.g., employ pre-thinking strategies, such as think/pair/share or pre-writes; and 5) develop and post a list of effective question stems appropriate to your context.

Eliciting evidence through students' written work

In classroom formative assessment, students' written work offers rich information about what students know and about how they know it. It is not necessarily a formal, pen-and-paper task. In fact, for many students and on many learning goals this is not the most efficient or accurate way to establish what students know and how they are approaching their learning. When planning to gather written evidence, consider **alternate forms of assessment**, including:

- Drawing
- Concept maps
- Model building
- Investigations
- Representations
- Graphic organizers
- Detailed outlines

When gathering written evidence, ask students to document **multiple ways to approach a problem** or address an issue. A similar aspect of this approach is to let students set some parameters around completing an assessment task, e.g., provide differentiated tasks related to the same learning goals and let students decide which task they are ready to solve.

For certain academic tasks (e.g., writing) the **revision process** is employed in a helpful way to guide students to use feedback from teachers or peers. When providing students with written feedback, always build time into the lesson for them to review and use that feedback.

Eliciting evidence through observations (and over time)

Unlike summative assessment, classroom formative assessment is not a single episode, event, or task. It is an ongoing, dynamic process that supports teachers to understand student learning over time. It challenges teachers to collect a range of evidence from a variety of sources to document student growth and learning over a longer period of time, e.g., through portfolios, reflective journals, and student learning journals. In formative assessment practice, these routines change in two subtle, but important

ways: 1) evidence collected is more tightly aligned to success criteria, learning goals, and learning progressions; and 2) students are more engaged as primary authors, evidence collectors, and ultimately the primary communicators about progress.

The following routines support observation and documentation of student progress over time:

- Classroom observation tools, such as whole class logs aligned to a set of unit learning goals in which teachers take quick notes during classroom discussions to document current status;
- Portfolios in which students are the primary authors, who identify what is important to share with others and track and celebrate their learning;
- Dialogue journals in which teachers and students maintain an ongoing conversation about how learning is proceeding (or by voice, where students record their reflections and teachers return their responses verbally); and
- Conferences between students and teachers to help students take the next steps in learning within a learning sequence.

Moving from Planning to Action

Eliciting, Interpreting, and Using Evidence of Learning to Adjust Teaching and Inform Feedback

	Eliciting Evidence of Learning	Interpreting Evidence of Learning	Using Evidence of Learning to <i>Adjust Teaching</i>	Using Evidence of Learning to <i>Inform Feedback</i>
Main idea	Teachers plan to elicit evidence of learning in order to understand where students are in their learning. Through evidence, teachers and students better understand what students know and how they are proceeding in relation to the learning goal.	Teachers examine the evidence in relation to the learning goals and success criteria to determine how they can best “close the gap” between current status and learning goals.	Teachers adjust instruction based on their interpretation of the evidence, their understanding of the learners, and their knowledge of academic content.	Teachers provide ongoing descriptive feedback to students about their progress towards the learning goal. This includes opportunities for students to clarify and apply the feedback they have received.
Key elements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The strategies or tools that are used to elicit evidence must show the student’s learning in relation to the learning goal and success criteria for this unit/lesson. • Students are provided with multiple opportunities throughout a learning sequence to demonstrate how their learning is progressing. • Students are assessed in multiple ways, using a variety of assessment formats, to show what they know. • Since students will be in different points along the learning progression, strategies to elicit evidence should allow for a range of responses and show results at various points along the learning progression. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The learning goal and success criteria provide the framework for interpreting the data. During interpretation, teachers determine if the students met the criteria, are on their way to meeting the criteria, or are showing problems, misconceptions, or difficulties. • Interpreting multiple data sources allows teachers to draw more valid inferences about next steps in learning. • When teachers work to interpret evidence of learning, the focus is on what the students know. This provides guidance for next steps. • Evidence collected must be sufficiently detailed or “nuanced” enough to lead towards taking a specific action. • Evidence that is collected but not interpreted is wasted effort. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assessment is formative only if something is “formed” by the evidence. • As a result of the evidence (and interpretation), teachers plan actions they will take to help students move forward within the <i>zone of proximal development</i>. • Teachers use formative evidence to select learning experiences that will appropriately challenge students to take next steps in learning. • Since learning is happening all the time, teachers may use ongoing evidence to make “minute-by-minute” adjustments in order to support students to “close the gap” between current status and desired learning goals. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Teacher feedback is input that, together with students' own internal guidance, will help the students decide where they are in regard to the learning goals and what they will work on next. • Teachers provide students with feedback that offers specific information about what they have done well (in relation to the learning goal) and guides them to what they can do next to improve. • Feedback must be helpfully descriptive, and compare student work to the established criteria. Formative feedback is not evaluative (i.e., is not graded), nor does it compare students to each other. • Feedback needs to take place during instruction, while students are working towards meeting the learning goal.

	Eliciting Evidence of Learning	Interpreting Evidence of Learning	Using Evidence of Learning to Adjust Teaching	Using Evidence of Learning to Inform Feedback
Guiding practices	<p>There are five primary routines for eliciting evidence:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Elicit evidence through pre-assessments 2. Elicit evidence through classroom discussions 3. Elicit evidence through questioning 4. Elicit evidence through students' written work 5. Elicit evidence through student observation 	<p>Evidence of learning is best reviewed with the guidance of colleagues or in collaborative teams. To interpret evidence, teachers sort, organize, and evaluate student work samples to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Determine where students are in relation to the learning progression • Clarify next steps for different groups of students • Identify strategies to address student misconceptions • Identify how to support students who have exceeded the learning goals 	<p>The following instructional constructs can change as a result of the evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Flexible grouping • Pacing/sequencing • Materials/resources • Differentiating tasks • Strategic questioning • Written/oral feedback 	<p>When providing feedback, consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Structure <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Oral feedback, written feedback • Mode of delivery <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Individual, small group, or whole group feedback • Source of feedback <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Teacher, peer, self <p>Feedback as “assessment dialogue” helps students and teachers work together over time to explore next steps in learning.</p>
Key questions for teacher planning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How does the teacher align the strategies for eliciting evidence to the learning goal and the success criteria? • How does the teacher align the strategies for eliciting evidence to the learning progression? • Does the teacher need to collect evidence for all students? Some students? What criteria would be used to decide? • How will the teacher make decisions about which evidence to document, collect, and track? • What is the plan for how the resulting evidence will be provided to students (written, oral, whole group, small group, individual)? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What does the evidence indicate about where students are in their learning? • Are students on their way towards meeting the criteria? • Are students having misconceptions that need to be addressed? • Where are individual students, groups of students, or the whole class in relation to the learning progression/learning goal? • How can I organize this data to help me think about next steps? • Are there problems, misconceptions, or difficulties that need to be addressed? By whom? • Are there areas where student learning can be accelerated? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What can the teacher do to ensure that each student is working in their <i>Zone of Proximal Development</i>? • Are there some aspects of content that need re-teaching for the whole group? • Are there aspects of this content that students already know, and that we do not need to cover in depth? • Are there specific groups of students whose needs are similar (and can be taught in a small group)? • Are there any individual students who have specific needs? How can the teacher best address those needs? • How will the teacher differentiate learning tasks to support all students to take next steps in learning? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Would it be advantageous to provide student feedback during individual conferencing? If so, how would that be structured in the next few days? • When will students have an opportunity to act on the feedback that has been provided? • How will time be structured for students to revise, rewrite, or practice? • How will the teacher check back to “close the loop” on the students’ use of the feedback? • What opportunities can be established for peer review of work in this unit? • Are there natural activities for student self-assessment?

**Rhode Island Department of Education
Formative Assessment Community of Practice
Module 3 Evaluation**

Consider the following **before and after** questions, which help us better understand your background knowledge:

	Mostly unfamiliar	Somewhat unfamiliar	Somewhat knowledgeable	Very knowledgeable
Before this session, my knowledge of eliciting evidence through formative assessment was...				
After this session, I would characterize my knowledge of eliciting evidence through formative assessment as...				
Before this session, my knowledge of using formative assessment routines was...				
After this session, I would characterize my knowledge of using formative assessment routines as...				
Before this session, my knowledge of how to manage data was...				
After this session, I would characterize my knowledge of how to manage data as...				

Please clarify what you would change about today's session or where you are seeking additional support:

1. To move my own learning forward in formative assessment, I could use continued support in the following:

2. What didn't work for me (or what I would change) from today's session:

Appendix D: Extended Learning Opportunities

Expanding Use of Routines

If teams (or a pair of colleagues) want to continue adding routines to their repertoire, they could observe a colleague who effectively uses one they wish to learn or improve, try it out in their classroom, gather evidence, and discuss results with the colleague who they observed. A team can plan on focusing on a particular routine for a month or quarter, gather evidence, and meet to share their data and discuss appropriate adjustments in instruction. Then, they could document the impact of the changes on student learning and meet to review their findings as a team.

Conducting Discussions/Academic Dialogues

If participants want strategies for conducting class discussions or academic dialogues, they can explore the resources on the following websites and discuss implications and application to their teams or classrooms with a colleague(s):

- <http://www.learnnc.org/lp/pages/4994> contains information and strategies for conducting Socratic Seminars;
- <http://www.greece.k12.ny.us/academics.cfm?subpage=1250> provides history and information about the Socratic method and seminars and resources that can be adapted for different subjects and lessons, e.g., how to facilitate thoughtful dialogue, a sample of opening and sustaining questions, and a description of the responsibilities of leader and participants; and/or
- <http://www.readwritethink.org/classroom-resources/lesson-plans/literature-circles-getting-started-19.html> offers a lesson plan for using literature circles to encourage small group discussions within classrooms around literature.

Improving Questioning Techniques

If participants want to focus on improving their questioning techniques, they can identify the questioning practices that occur in each other's classrooms by using the audit sheet, developed by Education Services Australia, on page 30 of Appendix D. With the results, they could form a study group to research questioning techniques (starting with the first three resources listed under online resources on page 33), use them to develop key questions for lessons, try them out in their classrooms, and assess the changes in student engagement and learning.

Exploring Ways of Managing Evidence Gathered During Observations

If participants want to explore other ways to collect data during observations, they can search the West Virginia Department of Education's website (<http://wvde.state.wv.us/teach21/Observations.html>). One of the resources suggested, "Observing Students: Informal Strategies for Effective Classroom Assessments," provides strategies applicable for Pre-K through grade 8 (<http://www.2.scholastic.com/browse/article.jsp?id=3749065>).

Professional Learning: Strategic Questioning

An audit of classroom questioning

Class _____ Date _____ Teacher _____

Activity	Number of Occasions	Comment
<p>The teacher...</p> <p><i>...makes explicit the key questions of the lesson</i></p> <p><i>...asks closed questions</i></p> <p><i>...asks open questions</i></p> <p><i>...asks questions that demand higher order thinking</i></p> <p><i>...asks questions to prompt students to further responses</i></p> <p><i>...waits for student response after asking a question</i></p> <p><i>...builds on student responses, even if they are wrong</i></p> <p><i>...distributes questions around the class</i></p> <p><i>...acknowledges student responses positively</i></p> <p>The students...</p> <p><i>...ask questions of the teacher</i></p> <p><i>...ask questions of each other</i></p>		

*Place a tick in the column for each time that the behavior is observed.

Source: Retrieved on November 12, 2012 from Education Services Australia's Assessment for Learning http://www.assessmentforlearning.edu.au/professional_learning/modules/strategic_questioning/strategic_questioning_landing_page.html

References

- Andrade, H. G. (2000). Using rubrics to promote thinking and learning. *Educational Leadership*, 57, 13-18.
- Black, P., Harrison, C., Lee, C., & Wiliam, D. (2003). *Assessment for learning: Putting it into practice*. New York, NY: Open University Press.
- Black, P., Harrison, C., Lee, C., Marshall, B., & Wiliam, D. (2004). Working inside the black box: Assessment for learning in the classroom. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 86, 8-21.
- Brookhart, S.M. (2010). *Formative assessment: Strategies for every classroom. An ASCD action tool*. Alexandria, VA: ASCD.
- Burns, M. (2005). Looking at how students reason. *Educational Leadership*, 63, 26-31.
- Chappuis, J. (2005). Helping students understand assessment. *Educational Leadership*, 63, 39-43.
- Chappuis, J. (2009). *Seven strategies of assessment for learning*. Portland, OR: Educational Testing Service.
- Hattie, J. (2012). *Visible learning for teachers: Maximizing impact on learning*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Heritage, M., & Wylie, E. C. (2010). *Formative assessment: Making it happen in the classroom*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.
- Heritage, M., Kim, J., Vendlinski, T., & Herman, J. L. (2009). From evidence to action: A seamless process of formative assessment? *Educational Measurement: Issues and Practice*, 28, 24-31.
- Moss, C. & Brookhart, S. (2009). *Advancing formative assessment in every classroom: A guide for instructional leaders*. Alexandria, VA: ASCD.
- Stiggins, R. J., Arter, J., Chappuis, J., & Chappuis, S. (2004). *Classroom assessment for student learning: Doing it right—using it well*. Portland, OR: Assessment Training Institute.
- Stiggins, R. (2007). Assessment through the student's eyes. *Educational Leadership*, 64, 22-26.
- Wiliam, D. (2007). Five "key strategies" for effective formative assessment. *NCTM Research Brief*. Reston, VA: The National Council of Teachers of Mathematics.
- Wiliam, D. (2011). *Embedded formative assessment*. Bloomington, IN: Solution Tree Press. (Chapter 5, pp. 107-132 – Providing feedback that moves learning forward.)

Online Resources

Questions to promote higher order thinking, Prince George's County website for teachers

<http://www.pgcps.org/~elc/isquestiontopromote.html>

Strategic questioning techniques, Australia Assessment for Learning module

http://www.assessmentforlearning.edu.au/professional_learning/strategic_questioning/strategic_research_background.html

Examples of formative assessment, West Virginia Department of Education website

<http://wvde.state.wv.us/teach21/ExamplesofFormativeAssessment.htm>

Techniques for gathering data during observations

<http://wvde.state.wv.us/teach21/Observations.html>